

Data Appendix: “Weathering the Storm”: Federal Efforts Helped Bolster U.S. Education Standing Among Peer Nations

Test data for the tutoring analysis were collected from the [NAEP annual score cards](#). Tutoring data were collected through a survey of news articles, state bills, and educational resource databases. The criteria to accept a state as having offered tutoring was simply that they announced an offering of tutoring for the 2021-2022 school year. A large number of states implemented tutoring after the 2021-2022 school year, including Ohio, but the most current scores available come from spring 2022. Thus, we don't consider these states in the analysis. There were two ways to determine if a state had not offered a tutoring program. First was the announcement that they would establish a program after the 2021-2022 school year, which were taken as confirmation that a prior program did not exist. Second was the lack of discussion of a tutoring program, indicated as no source (NS) in the dataset. When possible, we identified high-dosage tutoring using specific program details that verified program structure aligned with high-dosage tutoring standards (3 sessions of at least 30 minutes in small groups). When this was not available, we deferred to self-identification. Below are notes on edge cases:

- New Mexico: In July of 2021 New Mexico [allocated 22 million to](#) "support strategies to accelerate learning" which included "professional learning on academic acceleration, communities of practice for educators and administrators, developing high-dosage tutoring programs which include evidence-based curriculum and pedagogy, and peer-to-peer tutoring and mentoring". The state Department of Education notes that [their program to hire educational assistants](#) would improve workforce development around education and increase the ratio of adults to students within the classroom for more personalized learning. The additional support for teachers and targeted small-group instruction was created to provide targeted support to students, especially as they continue to rebound from the pandemic. In the fall of 2021, [state Senator Heinrich claimed the program was intended to help with tutoring](#), but nowhere do they provide a statement that they completed a roll out of tutoring across the state in the 2021-2022 school year. Thus, we denote New Mexico as having not implemented tutoring.
- Arkansas: Although the Arkansas Tutoring Corps was founded in fall 2021, students [had only completed 340 documented hours of tutoring](#) by December 2021. Rules did not yet exist for the Corps at that time. By March they had [219 tutors hired to the program](#) but we don't have a clear picture of the state of their tutoring program from January to March, which was when the NAEP was administered. Thus, we are unlikely to see an effect and therefore consider Arkansas as having not implemented tutoring.
- Nebraska did not implement a statewide program, but the state funded a [tutoring program](#) in its largest district. This district covers approximately [1/6th](#) of [all Nebraskan students](#).